

VU Research Portal

The Moral Formation of Business Students

van Baardewijk, J.J.

2018

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

van Baardewijk, J. J. (2018). *The Moral Formation of Business Students: A Philosophical and Empirical Investigation of the Business Student Ethos*. [PhD-Thesis - Research and graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Table of Content

Voorwoord	9
------------------	---

General Introduction	16
1.1 Challenges for Today's Economy	20
1.2 'Ethos' and the Conceptual Framework of 'Moral Ethology'	28
1.3 A Moral-Ethological Analysis of Business Schools	35
1.4 Organization of the Argument	40
1.5 Audiences Addressed	42

Part I:	
The Contested Business School Ethos	46
Introduction Part I	47

Chapter 2:	
Literature Review:	
What Scholars Say	49
Introduction	50
2.1 Mintzberg: A Management-Reality-Check for Business Schools	54
2.2 Goshal: Hidden Values in the Scientific Business Mind-Set	59
2.3 Moldoveanu and Martin: An Innovation and Creativity Critique	63
2.4 Carnegie: Liberal Arts to Counter Market-Thinking	66
2.5 Grey: Making Management Education Self-Critical	68
2.6 Schlee: The Ideological Problem in Business Studies	71
Conclusion	74

Chapter 3:	
Empirical (Q-)Research:	
What Students Say	83
Introduction	84
3.1 Methodology: What is Q methodology?	84
3.2 Interview Samples and Derivation of Concourse Statements	87
3.3 The Q-analysis and its Results	96
3.4 Interpretation of Results: A First Preview of the Different Types of Ethos	97
3.5 Type A: The Do-Good-Managers	99
3.6 Type B: The Market-Managers	100
3.7 Type C: The Searching-Managers	101
3.8 Type D: The Balancing-Managers	103
3.9 Type E: The Radical-Market-Managers	103
3.10 Similarities Between the Types of Ethos	104
Conclusion	106
Evaluation Part I	108

Part II:	
The Origins of the Contested Business School Ethos	114
Introduction Part II	115

Chapter 4:

The History of

Business Schools	117
Introduction	118
4.1 Phase I (1900-1960): The Social- Practical Onset of Business Schools	118
4.2 Phase II (1960-1990): The Scientific Transformation of Business Schools	124
4.3 Phase III (1990-): The Marketization of Business Schools	130
4.4 How the Content (the 'What') of Business Education affects its Form (the 'How')	135
4.5 The Dominance of the Anglo- Saxon Model in Today's Business Schools	140
Conclusion	146

Chapter 5:

Business Schools as

Institutions of Modernization	149
Introduction	150
5.1 Modernization: Weber, Habermas and MacIntyre	151
5.2 Hidden Values in Scientific Theories and Consultancy Tools of Business Studies	159
5.3 MacIntyre on the Hidden Cultural Values in Modern Ethics	165
5.4 MacIntyre on Today's Ethics of Emotivism/Expressivism	169

5.5 MacIntyre on Modern Society and the Role of Management	171
Conclusion	178
Evaluation Part II	182

Part III:	
Towards an Enriched	
Business Student Ethos	184
Introduction Part III	185

Chapter 6:

A Moral Ethological Analysis of Business (With MacIntyre Beyond MacIntyre)	189
Introduction	190
6.1 MacIntyre's Virtues-Goods-Practice-Institution Schema	190
6.2 MacIntyre's Ideas of the Narrative Identity and Traditions	196
6.3 What is the Purpose of a Firm? The 'Thin' Answer	201
6.4 What is the Purpose of Business and Management? A 'Thick' Answer	207
6.5 Make Practice-Institutions Purposeful with Citizen Involvement.	215
Conclusion	222

Chapter 7:

A Moral Ethological Analysis of Markets (the relevance of Hegel)	225
Introduction	226
7.1 Hegel's Attempt to Unite Individuality with the Common Good	227
7.2 Hegel on Consumption, Production and Bildung	231
7.3 Hegel on Social and Political Organization of the Market	234
7.4 Hegel's 'Statism' in between Communitarianism and Liberalism	236

7.5 Hegel and the Modern Economy – An Evaluation	240
Conclusion	245

Chapter 8:

Towards a new Business

Mindset	247
Introduction	248
8.1 Aristotle on a Cultivated Ethos and Different Types of Knowledge	249
8.2 What is Practical Understanding? (Polanyi, Schön, Sennett, Heidegger)	258
8.3 Cultivate the Moral Identity of Students (Taylor, Frankfurt, Nussbaum)	266
Conclusion	274
Evaluation Part III	277

General Conclusion	282
---------------------------	-----

Summary	298
----------------	-----

Appendix: Q-Statements	306
-------------------------------	-----

Literature	308
-------------------	-----

Index	322
--------------	-----